

**SYDNEY AIRPORT COMMUNITY FORUM (SACF)****Meeting 2/2019, 11 October 2019****AGENDA ITEM 1      Opening Remarks and Adoption of Agenda**

The Chair welcomed members and guests and acknowledged the traditional owners of the land.

The Chair reminded everyone the meetings are recorded and then deleted after the draft Summary Record has been prepared.

The Chair acknowledged Mr Osborne as the new SACF secretariat.

**AGENDA ITEM 2      Confirmation of Draft Summary Record of Meeting 1/2019**

The draft Summary Record was circulated on 11 April 2019.

**2.1      *Incorporation of suggested changes***

The SACF Secretariat did not receive any requests for changes to the draft Summary Record of Meeting 1/2019.

**2.2      *Action items arising from previous meetings***

All actions from the previous meeting had been completed at the start of the meeting, except for Action Items 03/01 and 04/01. The outstanding Action Items were completed at the meeting through a presentation by Ms Jost (Action Item 03/01) and the Chair's decision not to include the 'Implementation of LTOP Mode 9' as a standing item on the SACF Agenda (Action Item 04/01) as this topic is covered under the existing 'Implementation and Monitoring Committee (IMC) Report' Agenda Item.

**AGENDA ITEM 3      Community Question Time – Members of the Community**

Since the last meeting of SACF on 1 March 2019, the SACF Secretariat did not receive any questions from the community.

Mr Thistlethwaite MP raised a concern from his constituents. Constituents had raised concerns about noise-sharing and aviation safety arising from aircraft following the 110-degree turn on the F mode flightpath, particularly in relation to aircraft separation. Ms Jost and Captain Edney confirmed there was no safety concern. CASA has approved the flightpath and, while a minor programming issue had arisen in recent months, the issue did not impact on aviation safety and had been resolved by Airservices Australia. Ms Jost committed to take the question on notice and to discuss the issue at the next meeting of the Implementation and Monitoring Committee and the next SACF meeting.

**Action Item 01/02 – Airservices Australia to report on the programming issues affecting aircraft movements on the F Mode flightpath at the next IMC and SACF meetings.**

Discussion followed on the opportunity for advances in technology to lead to improved noise-sharing, including the possible adoption of Required Navigation Performance (RNP) technology at Sydney Airport. The Forum discussed the configuration of existing flightpaths, which intend to move aircraft over the coast and away from residential areas. It was

acknowledged RNP does sometimes result in a concentration of aircraft noise over some areas. Ms Jost noted that Airservices Australia is aware of these issues and has committed to extensive consultation ahead of any future changes.

#### **AGENDA ITEM 4      Sydney Gateway – Transport for NSW**

Mr Stevenson, Delivery Director, Roads and Maritime Services (RMS), and Ms Hirst, Senior Communications and Stakeholder Engagement Manager, RMS, gave a presentation on the Sydney Gateway Project. The project aims to make it easier to travel to and between the airport's terminals, while also benefiting local communities by removing trucks from local roads. The project is required to help accommodate forecast growth in freight and passenger numbers moving through Sydney Airport, and will also benefit the broader Sydney road network.

Mr Clarke, Captain Edney, Ms Patrinos and Mr Patterson raised a number of queries about the project, unrelated to LTOP, including the project's impact on Gardeners Road. Ms Hirst explained Gardeners Road was out of scope of the project, but took the question on notice.

**Action Item 02/02 – RMS to provide information on the potential traffic impacts of the Sydney Gateway Project on Gardeners Road.**

Mr Plummer, Sydney Airport Corporation Limited (SACL), advised the Forum that the Sydney Gateway Project is subject to a Major Development Plan. Mr Plummer confirmed the project would not affect aircraft noise or noise-sharing arrangements.

#### **AGENDA ITEM 5      Sydney Airport Update**

Mr Plummer provided an overview of recent activities pertinent to Sydney Airport. Highlights included:

- The Deputy Prime Minister's approval of the Sydney Airport 2039 Master Plan on 28 March 2019.
- The proposed development of a Pier A extension at Terminal 1. SACL will prepare a Major Development Plan for this proposed development, which Mr Plummer noted is consistent with the approved Master Plan and will not increase aircraft noise, aircraft movements or passenger numbers beyond the forecasts within the Master Plan.
- Essential runway maintenance works will be conducted during the curfew period.
- An overview of the Sydney Airport deliberative community panel.
- The renaming of Sydney Airport buildings to celebrate Australia's aviation pioneers.
- Sydney Airport's new Reconciliation Action Plan.
- The establishment of a Community and Environmental Projects Reserve Fund between Bayside Council and SACL.
- SACL's commitment towards carbon neutral operations by 2025, including a Sustainability Linked Loan.
- Sydney Airport's one billionth passenger.

Mr Clarke and Mr Hayes questioned the make-up of the deliberative panel. Mr Plummer clarified it consisted of 40 people from the communities around Sydney Airport, and was drawn from roughly 300-400 applicants. These applicants were drawn from the seven local

government areas nearest to Sydney Airport, including Sutherland Shire Council, and roughly align with the N70 noise footprint. Mr Plummer clarified that future deliberative panels may include representation from further afield, noting that all of Sydney uses the airport. As the first topic considered by the panel refers to the communities around Sydney Airport, SACL considered that limiting the panel's representation to people from these communities was appropriate.

Mr Clarke asked whether the name should be changed to reflect the local nature of the community panel. Mr Plummer said he would take it under consideration.

Mr Hayes raised community concerns around the 'fuzziness' of the ANEF contours, and asked how the detail of an ANEF could be made more readily available to councils and local communities. Mr Plummer advised SACL provides ANEF GIS data to councils within 24 hours of a new ANEF being endorsed. Mr Plummer also noted the ANEF 20 contour is delineated as a dotted line, rather than a solid line, to highlight the 'fuzziness' of aircraft noise effects.

SACF members briefly discussed the history of the ANEF process and the detail an ANEF provides. SACF members noted aircraft noise does not stop at a line on a map, whether an ANEF or N70 diagram. Mr Plummer noted the Master Plan has an explicit statement to this effect.

Mr Abrams expressed the support of international airlines for the proposed Pier 1A Expansion Major Development Plan.

#### **AGENDA ITEM 6      Airservices Australia Report**

Mr Scott provided an update from Airservices Australia. Key highlights included:

- An overview of Airservices Australia's *Aircraft In Your Neighbourhood Portal*, an online portal which provides information on nearby flightpaths as well as links to monthly interactive aircraft noise complaint reporting.
  - The portal is accessible through:  
<https://aircraftnoise.airservicesaustralia.com>
- A brief overview of a series of videos Airservices Australia has produced regarding air traffic control operations.

Ms Jost presented on Airservices Australia's process for noise complaint handling and monitoring, including an explanation of why Airservices Australia reports on the number of complainants per airport per quarter, rather than the number of complaints. This presentation covered the benefits of this change since it was introduced in 2012, including a better focus on identifying the suburbs most affected by aircraft noise. Ms Jost also discussed Airservices Australia's methods for investigating and responding to aircraft noise complaints, and the role of the Aircraft Noise Ombudsman in reviewing Airservices Australia's responses.

Mr Clarke stated much of the community believes there is no point in making complaints about aircraft noise to Airservices Australia. Ms Jost responded every complaint received is recorded and investigated.

Mr Clarke argued that the current approach of noise complaint monitoring and reporting does not accurately reflect the impact of aircraft noise experienced by people in a particular suburb. Ms Jost acknowledged some people do not submit complaints, and that the number

of complainants does not approach the number of people living under flightpaths and otherwise affected by aircraft noise.

Mr Hayes encouraged people who felt discouraged from submitting a complaint to Airservices Australia to instead contact their local, state or federal MP.

Ms Patrinos suggested Airservices Australia change the name of its noise complaint area to better highlight the limits under which it operates, and to alert the public that Airservices Australia is limited in its options for resolving noise complaints (i.e., Airservices Australia cannot close an airport, reduce the number of flights, refuse to let an aircraft land or take-off, or police noise levels). Ms Jost noted the difference between major metropolitan and smaller regional airports, and discussed Airservices Australia's successes in working with operators in smaller, less constrained airports to alter operating procedures to resolve noise complaint issues.

Ms Patrinos also questioned whether there would be an alternative statistical method which could report on the intensity of community feeling about aircraft noise, in addition to the number of complainants. Ms Jost replied that Airservices Australia was unaware of any such statistical methodology.

#### **AGENDA ITEM 7      National Acoustic Laboratories (NAL) Review Study Update**

The Chair agreed at the previous meeting of the Forum (Meeting 01/2019) to include this topic as a standing Agenda Item. While no member of the Forum had an update on this topic, Mr Clarke asked that it remain as an Agenda Item as the US Federal Aviation Authority (FAA) report on this topic has not yet been released.

Mr McArthur advised the US Government has chosen not to release the FAA study at this time. Concerns were raised regarding the effects of acoustic and non-acoustic factors on the impacts of aircraft noise.

#### **AGENDA ITEM 8      Implementation and Monitoring Committee (IMC) Report**

The Chair advised the IMC had met twice since the previous SACF meeting (Meeting 01/2019), on 19 March 2019 and 27 September 2019.

Mr Clarke advised the IMC minutes had not yet been circulated to the SACF membership. The IMC meeting on 19 March (Meeting 152) was to address an Action Item from SACF meeting 03/2018 (SACF Action Item 2/01 – Airservices Australia to examine the impact on vertical separation of moving flights currently over the eastern suburbs 2-3 kilometres further east). This issue was caused by a number of aircraft not keeping to the Standard Terminal Arrival Route (STAR) when approaching from the north. Airservices Australia have worked with air traffic control to rectify this issue, with the number of aircraft conforming to the STAR improving from 30% to around 80% of relevant movements.

Mr Clarke noted there had been some confusion around the IMC Action Item about the implementation of LTOP Mode 9, which IMC asked Mr Clarke to bring back to SACF for discussion. The Chair of SACF had written a letter to the IMC requesting IMC consider the implementation of LTOP Mode 9. However, this letter refers to a SACF Action Item from the

2018 meetings (the letter mistakenly referred to Action Item 01/03 from meeting 01/2019, when it should have referred to Action Item 03/01 from Meeting 03/2018). The SACF Secretariat gave an undertaking to resolve these issues.

**Action Item 03/02 – SACF secretariat to circulate minutes of IMC meetings 152 and 153 to SACF membership.**

Mr Clarke identified a number of Airbus A350 would be making arrivals on Runway 16L/34R for runway balancing purposes. IMC also noted Mr Roger Chambers has left Airservices Australia, and thanked Mr Chambers for his cooperation over the years. Mr Clarke and SACF members also thanked Mr Chambers.

Mr Clarke also noted the implementation of LTOP Mode 9 was a topic of discussion at recent IMC meetings. Some SACF members raised concerns the airspace and flightpath development for Western Sydney Airport may impact on the implementation of LTOP Mode 9. Both the Department and Airservices Australia maintained this design process will not affect LTOP as it is currently implemented. However, some members of IMC and SACF remained concerned the design process would prevent the future implementation of LTOP, and questioned whether the design process for Western Sydney Airport took precedence over the Ministerial directive to Airservices Australia to implement LTOP.

Mr Clarke expressed his concern that SACF had not been consulted on the airspace and flightpath design process for Western Sydney Airport, aside from a presentation from the Department at the previous SACF meeting (Meeting 01/2019). A presentation by Mr Hayes on the legal priority given to the Minister's direction to Airservices Australia to implement LTOP over and above the Western Sydney Airport Plan was provided (a transcript of Mr Hayes' presentation is included at **Attachment A**).

Mr Clarke suggested the Chair of SACF write to the Minister to request the Minister directs those involved in designing the airspace and flightpaths for Western Sydney Airport consider the future implementation of LTOP in the design process and protect the airspace required for its future implementation.

**Action Item 04/02 – Chair of SACF to write to the Minister responsible for the Western Sydney Airport to request a Ministerial direction to those involved in designing the airspace and flightpaths for Western Sydney Airport to consider the future implementation of LTOP in the design process and to protect the airspace required for its future implementation.**

Mr Clarke sought for SACF and other stakeholders in LTOP be actively consulted in the design process, also suggesting SACF should have an active role in the airspace design for Western Sydney Airport. Mr Clarke suggested this could be accomplished if SACF was granted ex officio membership of the body responsible for advising on this design process, the Expert Steering Group for Western Sydney Airport. Protocol dictates this request be

made to the Chair of the Expert Steering Group by the Chair of SACF. The Chair agreed to write such a letter. It was noted that the Department is represented on the Expert Steering Group, providing technical expertise on LTOP.

**Action Item 05/02** – Chair of SACF to write to Chair of the Expert Steering Group for the Western Sydney Airport, requesting a SACF representative be given ex officio membership of the Expert Steering Group.

Mr Hayes noted the next IMC meeting would conduct a gap analysis of the implementation of LTOP.

Mr Ward suggested the Chair could write a letter to the Minister requesting more information on the consultation to be undertaken with regard to the airspace and flightpath design for the Western Sydney Airport, and how SACF can more closely engage with the design process.

**Action Item 06/02** – Chair of SACF to write to the Minister responsible for the Western Sydney Airport to request information on the consultation to be undertaken with regard to the airspace and flightpath design for the Western Sydney Airport, and how SACF can more closely engage with the design process.

Mr Patterson queried the progress of the sunseting provisions for ten Regulations underneath the *Airports Act 1996* and the *Sydney Demand Management Act 1997*, and whether this regulatory reform work could impact on airspace protection or noise sharing arrangements at Sydney Airport. The Department agreed to present on the progress of the regulatory sunseting work as a standing Agenda Item in its report at future SACF meetings.

**Action Item 07/02** – The Department to provide an update on the progress of regulatory sunseting work as a standing Agenda Item at future SACF meetings.

## **AGENDA ITEM 9      Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Cities and Regional Development Report**

Mr McArthur advised the National Airports Safeguarding Advisory Group last met on 21 August 2019 and agreed the terms of reference for an implementation review of the National Airports Safeguarding Framework. Mr McArthur also discussed the curfew dispensation report and business jet curfew movements since the previous SACF meeting.

Mr Alves reported on the SACF correspondence received since the election, including (but not limited to, please see Action Item 04/02):

- A letter of 15 July 2019 from the Deputy Prime Minister, the Hon Michael McCormack MP, asking SACF members to confirm their continuing membership of the Forum;

- An email of 2 September 2019 from Mr Ted Plummer, Sydney Airport Corporation Limited, requesting the SACF Secretariat circulate a briefing on Sydney Airport's International Terminal 1 – Pier A Major Development Plan alongside the agenda; and
- An email of 23 September 2019 from the Office of the Aircraft Noise Ombudsman, inviting SACF members to contribute to a review of Airservices Australia's community engagement processes.

Mr Alves reported on calls received on the SACF phone line regarding the arrangements for the meeting.

**AGENDA ITEM 10     Other Business**

No request for other business was raised.

**AGENDA ITEM 11     Date of Next Meeting**

The next meeting was scheduled for a Friday in February 2020, with an exact date to be decided upon once the Parliamentary sitting calendar has been finalised.



**ATTENDANCE**

**Members**

J.	Alexander	Chair
J.	Ward	Assistant to the Chair
J.	Clarke	Representative for the Member for Bennelong
M.	Thistlethwaite	Member for Kingsford-Smith
B.	Leeson	Representing the Member for Kingsford-Smith
J.	Kertesz	Representing the Member for Reid
J.	Patterson	Representing the Member for Heffron
Z.	Solomon	Representing the Member for Summer Hill
F.	McDermott	Representing the Member for North Sydney
T.	Williams	Representing the Member for Cook
K.	Hill	Community Representative for the South
M.	Patrinos	Community Representative for the West
B.	Hayes	Community Representative for the North
K.	Welsh	Representing the Inner West Council
R.	Edney	Virgin Australia
T.	Plummer	Representing Sydney Airport Corporation Limited
B.	Abrams	Board of Airline Representatives of Australia

**Department of Infrastructure, Transport, Cities and Regional Development**

R.	McArthur	Director, Aircraft Operations Section
M.	Alves	Director, South West, ACT and NSW Airports Section
J.	McKinnon	Assistant Director, South West, ACT and NSW Airports Section
A.	Osborne	SACF Secretariat, South West, ACT and NSW Airports Section

**Airservices Australia**

R.	Jost	Noise Complaints and Information Service Manager
G.	Scott	Director Operations Terminal Services (Sydney)

**Observers and Presenters**

L.	Hirst	NSW Government – Roads and Maritime Services
V.	Shopov	NSW Government – Roads and Maritime Services
M.	Stevenson	NSW Government – Roads and Maritime Services

Note: Owing to an administrative oversight, the SACF website was not updated following the 11 March 2019 meeting. This meant potential additional observers did not have knowledge of the meeting. This oversight since been resolved.



## **Attachment A – Mr Hayes’ presentation**

- IMC has been informed by the Department of Infrastructure and Airservices that the design of Western Sydney Airport (WSA) airspace takes precedence over the Long-Term Operating Plan (LTOP). They have asserted to IMC that there can be no further changes to LTOP which are inconsistent with WSA airspace design.
- This is an invalid premise.
- The 1997 LTOP Ministerial Directive is a Legislative Instrument which obliges Airservices, by law, to progressively implement the LTOP Plan and the Proponent’s Statement.
- This Directive remains in force.
- Airservices Australia, in its latest Annual Report 2017/18, confirms that the 1997 Ministerial Directive remains a current and ongoing Airservices obligation and commits to progressive implementation of LTOP.
- Our understanding is that this Ministerial Direction, as a Legislative Instrument, takes legal precedence over the WSA Plan (and airspace design), which is not.
- Progressive implementation of LTOP must not be unreasonably constrained by WSA airspace design. LTOP has been partially implemented but much remains to be done.
- In fact, LTOP implementation includes WSA airspace, therefore integration and consultation is vital.
- The complete title of LTOP is "The Long-Term Operating Plan for Sydney Airport and Associated Airspace"
- The controlled airspace in the Sydney Airport Terminal Area is a circle 90 nautical miles (167 kilometres) in diameter. This is the “Associated Airspace” to which the 1997 Ministerial Direction refers.
- WSA, at only 45kms away from Sydney Airport, is within that Associated Airspace.
- Therefore, the two airports will need to share, and operate in, the same airspace. WSA airspace cannot be designed in isolation.
- The implications of the invalid premise of WSA precedence, if allowed to continue, would be :
  - Airservices’ legal obligation to progressively implement LTOP would be thwarted;
  - further significant improvements to Sydney’s aircraft noise burden would not be possible;
  - there will be no integrated “whole-of-Sydney airspace design”;
  - the requirement to consult with SACF on changes affecting LTOP will not be met.
- Legally, SACF must be consulted. The Ministerial Direction states that “Proposed changes to the elements of the Plan (LTOP) should be tested with the public through SACF before being implemented.”
- A consultative and conciliatory approach (previously proposed by SACF) is essential.

- The implications of the current invalid premise could not be more serious, fundamental and devastating for the LTOP, the work of SACF, IMC and the benefit of the Sydney Community.
- The current situation must be rectified.