

SUMMARY RECORD

SACF Meeting 4/2011

9:00 am-12:00 noon 18 November 2011

AGENDA ITEM 1 Opening Remarks and Adoption of Agenda

The Chair welcomed members, including the Member for Bennelong, Mr John Alexander MP who was attending his first SACF meeting.

Mr Alexander raised the issue of the announcement of a trial of a Ground Based Augmentation System (GBAS) by Airservices Australia, and it was agreed to consider this at Agenda Item 3.1.

The Chair stressed the need for SACF to work together on significant issues of interest to all SACF members, including Required Navigation Performance (RNP), the Long Term Operating Plan (LTOP), the Movement Cap and the Curfew, and not be diverted by minor issues. SACF aims to achieve consensus but will not avoid discussing issues because they are contentious.

It was agreed to consider the following suggested agenda items at the end of the meeting:

- Air Services (Aircraft Noise) Amendment Bill 2011
- Productivity Commission Inquiry
- Runway 34 STARs
- Night Noise
- The New Technology Study

It was agreed to amend Agenda Item 5.2 to read: 'Departures from runway 16L tracking over La Perouse *and Kurnell*.'

It was agreed to consider the issue of Performance Based Navigation at Agenda item 3.1.

Cr Betts requested that the issue of SACF meeting practices and protocols be raised under other business.

AGENDA ITEM 2 Confirmation of Draft Summary Record of Meeting 3/2011, 9 September 2011

2.1 Incorporation of suggested changes

It was agreed to amend Action 03/03 to remove the words "Airservices" and "Department's" and simply refer to '*the Proponent's Statement*'.

It was agreed to amend Action04/03 to read:

Airservices will provide a status report to SACF which responds to the following questions raised by Mr Hayes:

- 1. What elements of the Minister's 1997 Direction remain part of LTOP but are yet to be implemented?*
- 2. What elements have been deleted so they will no longer be implemented?*
- 3. What changes have been made where implementation has been or will be significantly different to what was originally approved by the Minister*
- 4. What are the reasons for any changes?*

Action 01/04 Airservices will provide a status report to the next SACF meeting which responds to the following questions raised by Mr Hayes:

- 1. What elements of the Minister's 1997 Direction remain part of LTOP but are yet to be implemented?**
- 2. What elements have been deleted so they will no longer be implemented?**
- 3. What changes have been made where implementation has been or will be significantly different to what was originally approved by the Minister**
- 4. What are the reasons for any changes?**

It was agreed to amend Agenda Item 8.1 to include the words: *"This item was drawn to the attention of members by Mr Hayes"* and to refer to the fact that comments about the curfew regulations and the curfew Act were made by Mr Hayes and Mr Stone.

It was agreed to accept the correct spelling for Mr Bihary.

There was discussion about the vote on the resolution about Night Time Noise. The Chair ruled that as it was not possible to re-create the vote, the suggested changes to the summary record regarding the Night Time Noise issue would not be made.

It was agreed to accept the changes suggested by Ms Patrinos to Agenda Item 8.5 – ANEFs ANEIs and the Movement Cap, by including the following words:

"Ms Patrinos had given notice of her intention to raise questions concerning ANEI's not having been produced since last quarter of 2009." Ms Bennetts stated ~~noted~~ that as a result of system problems the ANEIs have not been produced since the last quarter of 2009, and advised that Airservices will address the backlog and bring the ANEIs up to date by the first quarter of 2012, and keep them up to date going forward. Thereafter they would be produced before the end of the following quarter.

It was agreed to amend the related Action to read:

Action 13/03 Airservices to action outstanding quarterly ANEI reports by the first quarter of 2012 and keep them up to date thereafter *and ensure they are produced before the end of the following quarter.*

In regard to the suggested amendment to Agenda Item 8.6 it was noted that Australia is not a party to the Aarhus convention, and it was suggested that the summary record adopt the suggested changes but substitute the term *'be mindful of'* for the term *'consistent with'* in the proposed amendment.

Note: The Draft Summary Record of Meeting 3/2011 was not officially confirmed, at this Meeting. It was confirmed at a subsequent meeting.

2.2 Action Items arising from last meeting

It was noted that all action items have either been completed, or would be considered under the relevant agenda item.

AGENDA ITEM 3 Presentations on topics of interest

Mr Alexander raised the issue of the GBAS trial which was reported in the Sydney Morning Herald on 17 November 2011. The Chair asked Airservices whether this trial had commenced. Ms Bennetts reported that Airservices has had a trial in place since 2006, which aims to achieve CASA certification for this technology in 2012. Members queried how a trial could have been in place since 2006 when the Minister directed that RNP is not to be introduced in Sydney unless it is consistent with LTOP principles.

The Ground Based Augmentation System (GBAS) uses Global Navigation Satellite System technology to replace existing Instrument Landing Systems (ILS) during the final approach phase of aircraft landings. GBAS systems are cheaper, more compact and can service a number of runways. There was discussion about whether GBAS is an element of Required Navigation Performance (RNP). Airservices and airline representatives stated that they are separate but complementary systems.

Concern was expressed that there was no consultation with SACF prior to the publication of a procedure on this trial by Airservices. Airservices advised that this procedure was published in error and subsequently withdrawn. Airservices stated that there was no perceptible difference in the tracks flown using this technology, compared to using the Instrument Landing System (ILS) which has been in use for many years.

Action 02 /04 The Secretariat will check SACF and IMC records from 2006 to find out what information was provided on the GBAS trial.

There was discussion of Required Navigation Performance (RNP), its ability to position aircraft more precisely, and the impact that might have on the concentration of aircraft noise. The Chair put the view that it is SACF's responsibility to ensure that noise sharing is maintained and enhanced, and that RNP is not introduced in a way that compromises noise sharing.

There was discussion about the relationship between technology, safety and noise concentration, and whether noise concentration is the inevitable result of employing new technology to improve safety. It was pointed out that safety is a primary component of LTOP, and that RNP could assist in reducing aircraft noise, for example by providing a level of predictability that enables pilots to power off and glide, where this may not be possible with radar vectoring.

Action 03/04 Airservices to give a presentation on technology to the next SACF meeting, focused on the future air traffic management system which Airservices plans to introduce in the 2018-2020 timeframe.

The trial of the GBAS was discussed by the Forum which expressed concern that there was no recent consultation prior to the announcement of the trial. Members indicated that as a matter of principle SACF expects that the introduction of new technology should benefit the community and advance the noise sharing potential of LTOP. Members expressed the view that Airservices should consult with IMC and SACF before proceeding further with this trial.

Runway 34 STARS

Mr Woods outlined the trial which preceded the introduction of the 34 STARS flight path, and noted that the 34 STAR flight path has resulted in a concentration of aircraft noise along a very narrow track, where previously radar vectoring had ensured a spread of aircraft and aircraft noise. Mr Woods asked Airservices to indicate what can be done to address this noise concentration.

Airservices advised that the Minister has made a commitment to the Member for Cook that Airservices will look at how it can address this issue, particularly during noise sensitive times, such as early in the morning and late at night. Airservices will report back to the next SACF meeting on the results of this study.

Action 04/04 Airservices to report back to the next SACF meeting on what can be done to address the issue of noise concentration resulting from 34 STAR arrivals over Sutherland Shire during noise sensitive times.

Airservices advised that the technology to introduce noise spreading through multivariate tracks is not yet available, and currently this can only be achieved manually through radar vectoring. Mr Hayes put the view that the new RNP technology could be used to enable the implementation of elements of LTOP such as High and Wide and Trident.

Airservices advised that modelling for High and Wide arrival paths showed a large number of potential conflicts with departing aircraft. The Chair asked whether Airservices could provide a presentation to revisit the issue of High and Wide. Mr Hayes suggested that the Airservices presentation look at the LTOP flight paths that embody High and Wide, so that we can see what LTOP was trying to achieve. Airservices offered to frame its presentation (under Action 03/04) in terms of what is possible today and what can be done in the future.

AGENDA ITEM 4 Sydney Airport Report

Mr Plummer spoke briefly to the Sydney Airport Report, which was noted.

AGENDA ITEM 5 Long Term Operating Plan (LTOP) – Implementation Progress

5.1 Progress report on LTOP implementation

Ms Bennetts referred to the Sydney Airport Operational Statistics report and offered to respond to any questions.

5.2 Response to issues raised at the last meeting

- **Status report on the elements of the LTOP Direction (including response to Mr Hayes' letter)**
- **Status of 'the achievement of LTOP targets' as a Key Performance Indicator**
- **WebTrak upgrade**
- **Departures from runway 16L tracking over La Perouse and Kurnell**
- **Airservices Communications and Consultation Protocol**
- **ANEI reports**

Ms Bennetts referred to the report circulated with the meeting papers and offered to take questions. Mr Hayes put the view that significant elements of LTOP have not been implemented and that the integrity, intent and targets of LTOP are not being adequately met.

Action 05/04 Airservices to report back to the next SACF meeting on the issues concerning the implementation of LTOP raised by Mr Hayes on Page 64 of the Agenda Papers.

Airservices advised that the upgrade of WebTrak is in the design stage, and welcomed feedback from SACF members on ways it could be improved.

Airservices advised that it has conducted some analysis of overflights of La Perouse and Kurnell which found that Jetstar A320 aircraft have an aircraft performance issue which makes it difficult for them to accurately follow the departure track. Airservices will investigate how the procedure can be re-written to ensure that all aircraft can fly it accurately, and will report back to the next meeting on the outcome.

Airservices advised that a new version of the Airservices Communication and Consultation Protocol is on the website at: <http://www.airservicesaustralia.com/publications/corporate-publications/communication-and-consultation-protocol/>

Airservices stressed that this is an iterative process welcomes feedback on this document.

Airservices advised that the ANEI reports are progressively being updated and published on the website at: <http://www.airservicesaustralia.com/publications/reports-and-statistics/australian-noise-exposure-index-reports/>

AGENDA ITEM 6 Implementation and Monitoring Committee

Mr Hill reported that the IMC meeting was held on 18 October.

AGENDA ITEM 7 Department of Infrastructure and Transport Reports

7.1 Air Services (Aircraft Noise) Amendment Bill 2011

Mr Stone reported that the second reading speech for the Bill was presented on 31 October and debate was adjourned. The Bill will come back to Parliament at some point, probably in 2012.

It was noted that the Member for Pearce, Ms Judy Moylan MP, proposes to introduce some amendments to the Bill. It was agreed that Mr Hayes would re-table his motion on this Bill after those amendments had been made.

7.2 Report on measures to manage the Movement Cap

Mr Stone reported on measures introduced to address breaches of the Movement Cap at Sydney Airport. Sydney Airport operates under the *Sydney Airport Demand Management Act 1997* which stipulates that no more than 80 aircraft movements can occur in any regulated hour (measured on a rolling 15 minute basis). There were 8 breaches of the Cap in 2010 and the minister set up an Industry Working Group to develop new procedures to better manage the Movement Cap. There was one breach in June 2011 when the new procedures were partially implemented, and there has been no further breach since then. The Government has asked the Working Group to conduct a review in early 2012 of the implementation of the new procedures and their effectiveness, and welcomes input from SACF.

Action 06/04 The Department to provide a report to the next SACF meeting on the effectiveness of the new procedures to manage the Movement Cap.

7.3 Curfew Dispensation Report

It was noted that one dispensation had been approved.

7.4 SACF Correspondence

The correspondence report was noted. Mr Hill referred to correspondence from a Cronulla resident who was unhappy with the information provided to prospective builders about aircraft noise in relation to noise insulation.

Action 07/04 The issue of information provided to prospective homeowners and builders in areas that will be affected by aircraft noise to be considered at the next SACF meeting.

7.5 SACF Phone line

The SACF Phone line report was noted.

AGENDA ITEM 8 Date of Next Meeting

It was agreed to hold the next meeting on 24 February 2012.

OUTSTANDING MATTERS

Productivity Commission Inquiry

The Chair reported that he gave evidence to the Inquiry supporting both the Cap and the Curfew and specifically noted that there was no inconsistency between the Act and the Regulations in terms of the number of aircraft movements allowed under the Regulations during the curfew shoulder period.

Night Noise

Mr Clarke put the view that he still wanted to obtain data from Airservices, in electronic form, to enable analysis of issues related to Night Time Noise, particularly during the early morning hours.

The Chair determined that this matter had been dealt with at the last meeting.

New Technology Study

Mr Clarke noted that the meeting had not had time to discuss the New Technology Study, and that he wished to raise it at a future meeting.

Meeting Practice and Protocols

Cr Betts requested that SACF consider adopting a set of meeting procedures and protocols to assist in the smooth running of meetings.

Action 08/04 The Secretariat to provide a draft set of meeting procedures and protocols for consideration at the next meeting.

Required Navigation Performance (RNP) Position Paper

Mr Clarke noted that a revised version of the RNP position paper which was modified as requested by SACF was circulated with the Agenda Papers.

He also drew attention to Airservices' responses to the questions about RNP that he had asked at IMC, which were also included in the Agenda Papers.

ATTENDANCE

Members

| | | |
|----|--------------|--|
| P. | Fitzgerald | Chair |
| J. | Alexander MP | Member for Bennelong |
| S. | Betts | Representing the Member for Wentworth |
| J. | Bihary | Representing the Member for Bennelong |
| L. | Caulfield | Representing the Member for Marrickville |
| J. | Clarke | Representing the Member for Bradfield |
| R. | Edney | Australian Airline Industry |
| T. | Fasanella | Representing the Member for Reid |
| B. | Hayes | Representing the Member for North Sydney |
| K. | Hill | Community Representative for the South |
| L. | Kennedy | Mayor of Ashfield |
| S. | McArdle | Representing the Member for Kingsford-Smith |
| B. | O'Rourke | Representing the Member for Barton |
| M. | Patrinos | Community Representative for the West |
| J. | Patterson | Representing the Mayor of the City of Botany Bay |
| T. | Plummer | Sydney Airport Corporation Ltd |
| R. | Porteous | Mayor of Leichhardt |
| K. | Schreiber | Representing the Sutherland Shire |
| A. | Smith | Representing the Member for Sydney |
| J. | Stewart | Representing the Member for Heffron |
| J. | Woods | Representing the Member for Cook |

Department of Infrastructure

S. Stone General Manager, Aviation Environment
J. Collis Aviation Environment Policy Section, Secretariat
D. Carroll Airports Branch, New South Wales Section
S. George Airports Branch, New South Wales Section
L. Horrocks General Manager, Airports Branch
D. Southgate Head, Aviation Environment Policy Section

Airservices Australia

M. Bennetts General Manager, Environment
P. Carroll Sydney Operations Manager

Observers

J. Chan Sydney Airport Corporation Limited
T. Ong Sydney Airport Corporation Limited
B. Englaro Randwick City Council
H. Knox Overnight Airfreight Operators Association
D. Stani Overnight Airfreight Operators Association
I. Koernicke Sutherland Shire Council
J. Lovell Office of the Minister for Infrastructure and Transport
E. Pearson Office of the Member for Cook
A. Sellick Qantas
L. Sierakowski Office of the Member for North Sydney
J. Wastnaget Tourism and Transport Forum
M. Willey Brisbane Airport
T. Williams Community

Apologies

E. Barnett Representing the Member for Barton
W. Bennett Board of Airline Representatives of Australia